

III. VERTIMO TEORIJA IR PRAKTIKA / BADANIA NAD TEORIĄ I PRAKTYKĄ PRZEKŁADU

Lyudmila Diachuk

*Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics
The Department of Foreign Philology and Translation
Kioto str. 19, Kyiv 02156, Ukraine
E-mail: brousls@ukr.net*

*Research interests: translation studies, literary translation, contrastive linguistics,
intercultural communication*

PROFESSIONAL TRANSLATOR'S ETHICS: TRANSLATION ANALYSIS OF THE EXAMPLE OF FRENCH WOMEN'S PROSE

This article focuses on the ethical aspects of translation and the question of translators' responsibility, which nowadays are major issues in Ukraine. The paper demonstrates and reviews numerous cases of copyright infringement. As our research has shown, the texts are sometimes translated into Ukrainian not from their source language, but from Russian translations, which leads to double manipulations with the text. To verify this claim, French women's belles-lettres texts and their Ukrainian and Russian translations have been analysed and compared. The post-Soviet period of Ukraine's development has showcased not only the translation-related issues, but also the moral and ethical attitude of translators and publishing houses towards translation as the sphere of copyright. This analysis of Ukrainian translations raises concerns that some book titles, and sometimes the entire belles-lettres works of French women's prose, have been "copied" from Russian translations. The most significant, in this respect, is the Ukrainian translation of George Sand's novel "Consuelo", translated by Viktor Boyko and published in 2011 by the Kharkiv publishing house "Folio".

KEY WORDS: Translation Ethics, Gender Issues, French Women's Prose, Gender Competence, Accuracy of Translation.

Introduction

The present research of Ukrainian translations of French female authors' texts highlights a problem related to the human factor, and in fact, the ethics of the translator.

Translation scholars pay close attention to the ethical issues in translation, in particular, the standards of adequate translation, hermeneutical problems of text interpretation, problems of using machine translation, the question of authorship of the text and the authorship of the translation, and reflections of political correctness and gender aspects in translation.

The aim of the article is to define the role of translation ethics in connection with the translator's gender competence, meaning conscious and responsible attitude of the translator

towards conveying the gender identity of literary and artistic texts. The object of the present paper is the analysis of ethical dimension in relation to gender in original French women's works and their Ukrainian and Russian translations. The novelty of the research lies in the fact that the potential unethical issues in translation in Ukraine have not been the subject of a special study from the point of view of a practical approach employed to analyse French women's prose and its translations. The analysis is carried out by using the examples from translations of novels by George Sand "Consuelo" (1856): into Russian by Aleksandra Beketova in 1936 and into Ukrainian by Viktor Boyko in 2011 (Санд 2011); Françoise Sagan "Bonjour tristesse" (1954): into Russian by Yuliana Yahnina in 1975 (Сараг 1975) and into Ukrainian by Yarema Kravets in 1983 (Сараг 1983); Anna Gavaldà "L'échappée belle" (2009): into Russian by Irina Volevich in 2010 (Гавальда 2010) and Ukrainian translation by Ksenija Jermolajeva in 2013 (Гавальда 2013). Translations of the same work are arranged in chronological order according to the year of publication.

Therefore, this research employs a comparative and descriptive translation analysis based on the material of French women's belles-lettres texts and their available translations into the Russian and Ukrainian languages. Quantitative and contrastive analysis of the original and translated texts are applied as well.

Theoretical overview

In the West the research into the issues of ethical and professional attitude of translators towards their work begins in the 1980s. French historian and theorist of translation Antoine Berman is one of the first who becomes interested in the problem of the influence of "translation ethics" on transformational processes in translation (Berman 1984). The scholar considers the main task of translator's ethics to be in the acceptance of "the foreign" in its own language (Berman 1984: 74). Developing his opinion, it can be observed that from the point of view of gender aspects of ethics, it is very important to understand and accept the specificities of women's prose and accurately reproduce its rhythm and tone.

Ten years after the publication of Antoine Berman's work, the issue of ethics and translation is addressed again by Anthony Pym in his book titled *Pour une éthique du traducteur* (Pym 1997). Anthony Pym insists on the need to establish a true "professional ethics" and proposes to replace the concept of translation ethics with the deontology of translation (Pym 1997: 133). Later, American translation theorist Lawrence Venuti considers the ethical issues in translation based on the view that any translation project is ethnocentric, that is to say nationalistic, and ethical translation always demonstrates asymmetric relations between languages and cultures (Venuti 1998). Notably, in 1993, American scholar, literary theorist and feminist critic Gayatri Spivak suggests the concept of "ethics of cultural difference" for the analysis of translation transformations (Spivak 1993: 179–200). Canadian critic, translator, and academic Barbara Godard understands the ethics of translation as the "respect" of the original, where the translation is considered as "the gift

of the original” (Godard 2001). In the article “Gender and the Metaphors in Translation” a well-known scholar Lori Chamberlain emphasises that the problems of gender in translation are numerous and depend on the type of text, the language of translation and the cultural competence of the speaker (Chamberlain 1988). In the article titled “On Translator Ethics. Principles for Mediation between Cultures” Anthony Pym notes that free online data based machine translation now enables almost everyone to produce a translation of some kind; electronic social networking is enabling a wide range of volunteers to engage in collective translation projects (Pym 2012: 3).

The question of analysing the problems of ethical norms in translation is also explored in Ukraine. As an example, such researchers as Olena Maksymenko and Sergij Fokin provide an analytical review of deontological principles of professional ethics in the codes of International Association of Conference interpreters in a number of foreign countries, as well as in Ukraine (Максименко, Фокін 2010: 258–266).

To sum up, the analysis of the theoretical literature showed that the ethical issues in translation studies have been studied by many scholars. However, the importance of adhering to principles and standards of professional ethics by translators is becoming increasingly important in Ukraine, as it concerns not only the moral and ethical aspects of translators’ honesty but also the ways they receive financial returns. In addition, national publishing houses play a crucial role as they edit and provide quality assessment of translated texts. Nevertheless, it is rather difficult for the publishers to prove and to identify a plagiarised work. It means that editors should provide peer-review verification. Recently, the issue of the publication of Ukrainian translations which were done not from the original language but from Russian translations has become extremely difficult and relevant.

Famous Ukrainian translator and diplomat Sergij Borshchevskij has recently commented on translation plagiarism in *Literaturna Ukraina (Literary Ukraine)*, analysing, in particular, the business of the Kharkiv’s publishing house “Folio”. Sergij Borshchevskij warns about cases of copyright infringement by the abovementioned publishing house (Борщевський 2014: 12).

Results and discussion

The publishing house “Folio” published several translations of French writers’ works that arose suspicions of the strange similarities between the Ukrainian and Russian translations of the same French text. It is a question of certain “similarities” of the Ukrainian translations of French authors’ texts to the Russian translations. According to the author, these similarities can be conventionally divided into three types: *minimal, medium and maximal*.

Minimal matches can be regarded as the similarities of the Ukrainian and Russian translations of the titles of French belles-lettres works. They deal with standalone cases when the titles of French women’s belles-lettres works in the Ukrainian language are unreasonably similar to their Russian versions, which are indicative of “copying”.

Such an opinion is suggested by our analysis of the Ukrainian translations, in particular, of Anna Gavalda's novel "L'échappée belle" (2009) ("Ковток свободи", which literally means "The Gulp of Freedom", translated by Ksenija Jermolajeva in 2013) and Françoise Sagan's novel "Bonjour tristesse" (1954) ("Здрастуй, печаль!", which literally means "Hello, sadness!"), translated by Yarema Kravets in 1983).

Françoise Sagan's novel was translated by Russian translator Yuliana Yahnina and it was first published in the journal *Inostrannaia Literetura (Foreign Literature)* in 1970, titled "Здравствуй, грусть!" ("Hello, sadness!"). The "borrowing" of the Ukrainian variant of this title from the Russian translation is indicated by the use of the word "здрастуй" (hello) by the Ukrainian translators. In the Ukrainian language, there is a word "здравтувати" "to greet someone" (seldom "здравтувати"), which means: 1) to be healthy; to live happily (to exist successfully); 2) an imperative mood *здравтуй; (здравтуйте)* (hello); a word of greeting (СУМ 3: 549). For the Ukrainian-speaking reader, such Ukrainian title looks like a borrowing from Russian, including the word "печаль" (sadness), which is not in the vocative case. Two more variants of the title of this novel "Привіт, смутку!" (literally means "Hello, grief!") and "Добридень, смутку!" (literally means "Good afternoon, sadness!") would look much more Ukrainian than "Здрастуй, печаль!" ("Hello, sadness!"). It may be suggested that the Russian translation of 1970 had an impact on the choice of the Ukrainian translator for this novel's title, because then, in 1983, the russified version of the Ukrainian language was predominant in Ukraine. That is, the influence of ideological and political factors on the translation is observed.

The situation looks similar in the case of the translation of the title of Anna Gavalda's novel "Ковток свободи" ("The Gulp of Freedom"), translated by Russian translator Irina Volevich and published in 2010 under the same title ("The Gulp of Freedom"). The French phraseologism "l'échapper belle" means "échapper à un danger ou se sortir d'une situation délicate" ("avoid danger, succeed in getting out of a difficult situation") (DFL 2017). In 2013, in the independent Ukraine, the Publishing House "Klub simejnogo dozvillja" ("Family Leisure Club") published the Ukrainian translation of the French belles-lettres work, the title of which is a complete copy of the Russian version, where the translator did not even try to find her own equivalent for it.

Another, *medium type of coincidence*, according to the author of this article, can be found in the translations of Françoise Sagan's novel "Bonjour tristesse". Analysing the Russian and Ukrainian translations of this novel (published in 1975 and 1983 respectively), it is important to point out that there are instances of translation of French words and expressions, which strongly suggest an idea of "copying" from the Russian translation by Yarema Kravets, rather than similarities in the identical thinking of the Ukrainian and Russian translators. Analysing the following sentence, it is possible to affirm with certainty the complete borrowing from the Russian translation.

Table 1. **Fragment from Françoise Sagan’s novel “Bonjour tristesse” and its Russian and Ukrainian translations**

Source text	
<i>Il avait un visage de Latin, très brun, très ouvert, avec quelque chose d'équilibré, de protecteur, qui me plut (Sagan 1954: 13);</i>	
<i>He had a Latin face, very brown, very open, with something balanced, protective, which pleased me (our translation);</i>	
Yuliana Yahnina’s translation	Yarema Kravets’s translation
<i>У него было лицо типичного южанина, смуглое, открытое, и в выражении что-то спокойное и покровительственное, что мне понравилось (Саган 1975: 3);</i>	<i>Він мав відкрите смагляве обличчя південця, яке приваблювало своїм спокоєм та розсудливістю (Саган 1983: 247).</i>

Russian translator Yuliana Yahnina and Yarema Kravets translate an expression “un visage de Latin” applying a descriptive translation and not the method of calquing. Moreover, astonishingly, both the Ukrainian and Russian translators render this term, linking the appearance of the student Cyril’s face with the fact that he comes from the south, using the expression “un visage de Latin” in its direct meaning “Latino’s face”, connecting his supposed swarthinness with this fact.

Another example, taken from the novel by Françoise Sagan, also points at the idea of “borrowing” from the Russian translation.

Table 2. **Fragment from Françoise Sagan’s novel “Bonjour tristesse” and its Russian and Ukrainian translations**

Source text	
<i>Nous rejoignons la maison par le bois de pins et, pour nous réchauffer, nous inventions des jeux d’Indiens, des courses à handicap (Sagan 1954: 59);</i>	
<i>We would come to the house through the pine wood and to warm up, we would invent some Indian games and handicap races (our translation);</i>	
Yuliana Yahnina’s translation	Yarema Kravets’s translation
<i>Мы шли к дому через сосновую рощу и, чтобы согреться, затевали веселую возню, бегали взапуски (Саган 1975: 29);</i>	<i>Ми йшли додому сосновим гайком і, щоб трохи розігрітися, вигадували веселі забави, бігали наввипередки (Саган 1983: 275).</i>

In this case, Yarema Kravets resorted to a descriptive translation, as well as the Russian translator Yuliana Yahnina: instead of “des jeux d’indiens” (“Indians’ game”) the phrase was translated as “веселі забави” (“funny games”). In addition, Yarema Kravets also renders “courses à handicap” by a verb expression “бігали наввипередки” which is exactly as the translated Russian noun phrase “бегали взапуски” (“chased each other”).

Another type of similarity is *maximal* which deserves special and, perhaps, the closest attention. Our suspicions of some Ukrainian translations being done from Russian versions of French women’s prose require further detailed comparative analysis. In our opinion, the Ukrainian translation of George Sand’s novel “Consuelo”, translated by Viktor Boyko

and published in 2011 by the same Kharkiv publishing house “Folio”, can be considered as the maximum similarity case. The Russian translation of this novel was published in Russia translated by Aleksandra Beketova, a well-known Russian translator, writer, poet and mother of Russian poet Aleksandr Blok. Aleksandra Beketova did her translation of “Consuelo” in the late 19th century, and now it is reprinted in Russia edited by D. Livshits and V. Davidenkova.

For analysis, several representative sentences and short passages from the original work are proposed for consideration, in which certain words and expressions in the Russian and Ukrainian translations are practically identical. It starts with the analysis of the description of the school where Consuelo studied.

Table 3. Fragment from George Sand’s novel “Consuelo” and its Russian and Ukrainian translations

Source text	
<i>Toutes ces jeunes personnes n'étaient pas également pauvres, et il est bien certain que, malgré la grande intégrité de l'administration, quelques-unes se glissaient là, pour lesquelles c'était plutôt une spéculation qu'une nécessité de recevoir, aux frais de la République, une éducation d'artiste et des moyens d'établissement (Sand 2004: 22);</i>	
<i>All these young people were not equally poor, and it is quite certain that, despite the high integrity of the administration, some of them slipped into it, for them it was rather a speculation than a necessity to receive, at the expense of the Republic, an artist's education and the means of establishment (our translation);</i>	
Aleksandra Beketova's translation	Viktor Boyko's translation
<i>Не все эти молодые девушки были одинаково бедны, и, несомненно, несмотря на всю зоркость администрации, в школу проскальзывали иногда и такие, которые не так уж нуждались, но использовали возможность получить за счет республики артистическое образование и недурно пристроиться (Санд 1936: 10);</i>	<i>Не всі ці молоді дівчата були однаково бідні, і, безсумнівно, незважаючи на всю пильність адміністрації, до школи потрапляли іноді й такі, що не надто вже й бідували, але використовували можливість здобути за рахунок республіки артистичну освіту й непогано пристатуватися (Санд 2011: 17).</i>

It should be noted that one of the main criteria for the completeness of the coincidence of translations is to detect the unexpected inaccuracy of the semanticization of the word in the Russian version of translation, which is replicated in the Ukrainian language. This is seen in the translation of the French phrase “malgré la grande intégrité de l’administration”, which the Russian and Ukrainian translators gave, respectively, as “несмотря на всю зоркость администрации” and “незважаючи на всю пильність адміністрації” (“despite the high integrity of the administration”). The key mismatch in both translated versions is the reproduction of the French word “intégrité”, which together with the meaning of (“integrity, completeness, inviolability”) also means (“honesty, incorruptibility and purity”). Thus, deliberately or not Aleksandra Beketova conveys the meaning of the word as “зоркость”

(“sharpness of sight”), which Viktor Boyko reproduces in the Ukrainian translation from the Russian as “пильність” (“vigilance”).

In another instance, portraying Consuelo and her life in the Adriatic, George Sand describes the attitude of the local girls to her.

Table 4. **Fragment from George Sand’s novel “Consuelo” and its Russian and Ukrainian translations**

Source text	
<i>La pauvre fille n’y songeait guère, habituée qu’elle était à s’entendre traiter de guenon, de cédrat, et de moricaude, par les blondes, blanches et replètes filles de l’Adriatique (Sand 2004: 24);</i>	
<i>The poor girl did not think of it, she got accustomed to being treated as a monkey, a citron and a darkie by the fair-haired, white and plump daughters of the Adriatic (our translation);</i>	
Aleksandra Beketova’s translation	Viktor Boyko’s translation
<i>Бедная девочка об этом и не думала, она привыкла к тому, что все белокурые, белые и полненькие дочери Адриатики вечно звали ее “обезьяной”, “лимоном”, “чернушкой” (Санд 1936: 11);</i>	<i>Бідна дівчинка й не думала про це, вона звикла до того, що всі біляві, білі й повненькі дочки Адриатики вічно називали її “мавпою”, “лимоном”, “чорнушкою” (Санд 2011: 18).</i>

George Sand calls Consuelo “guenon”, “cédrat” and “moricaude”. However, if the meaning of the words “guenon” and “moricaude” respectively, the Russian “обезьяна” (“monkey”), “чорнушка” (“dark-skinned”) and the Ukrainian “мавпа”, “чорнушка” are rendered accurately, but the translation of the word “cédrat” by the word “лимон” (“lemon”) does not correspond to the author’s intention.

Analysing the epithets used to describe Consuelo’s appearance that compare her with the “мавпою”, “чорнушкою” (“monkey”, “dark-skinned”), it can be noticed that the word “лимон” (“lemon”) does not correspond to this list of definitions. In our opinion, using the word “cédrat”, the French writer wanted to demonstrate the negative connotations associated with this citrus fruit that is similar to a lemon, but is different in that it has a very ugly look, with its thick and knobby skin. Obviously, this particular feature of the citron was the basis of a comparative description of Consuelo’s appearance. It was not noticed in the Russian translation, and then mechanically copied in Ukrainian as well.

Unfortunately, these similarities are rather frequent in Ukrainian and Russian translations. They concern not only the reproduction (or in addition flaws) of the author’s lexical-semantic connotations of words and expressions. It is quite noticeable that the Ukrainian translation practically replicates the Russian one in terms of constructing sentences: the identity between expletive sentences, participial-verbal constructions, punctuation, in the opinion of the author, is a prime indication of “copying” of the Russian translation by the Ukrainian one. For instance, let us examine another sentence from George Sand’s novel, which is extremely revelatory.

One student expresses her dissatisfaction with the fact that Maestro praised Consuelo.

Table 5. Fragment from George Sand's novel "Consuelo" and its Russian and Ukrainian translations

Source text	
<i>Ah! voilà son grand mot lâché! s'écria la Costanza dès qu'il fut sorti (Sand 2004: 18);</i>	
<i>Ah! Here is his great catchphrase! Exclaimed the Costanza as soon as he had gone out (our translation);</i>	
Aleksandra Beketova's translation	Viktor Boyko's translation
<i>He мог не выпалить своего любимого словечка, – крикнула Клоринда, лишь только маэстро ушел (Санд 1936: 9);</i>	<i>He міг не випалити свого улюбленого слівця, – крикнула Клоринда, тількино маэстро пішов (Санд 2011: 16).</i>

"Ah! Voila son grand mot lâché!" is rendered by the Russian translator as: "He мог не выпалить своего любимого словечка" ("Could not help blurting out his favorite catchphrase"), transforming the grammatical structure of the original. In turn, Viktor Boyko's Ukrainian translation contains a construction entirely identical to that of the Russian translation: "He міг не випалити свого улюбленого слівця". Another proof of copying is that the original refers to a student named *Costenza*, and in Aleksandra Beketova's translation she is named *Clorinda*. In a strange way, Viktor Boyko made the same mistake, also indicating that it was *Clorinda*.

Thus, the assumption can be expressed that Viktor Boyko's translation is not only manipulative, in the sense of double "hi-jacking" of the writer's source text and the translator's target text, betraying the principles of the deontology of translation, although the fault also lies with the editors of the publishing house. According to the COPE Code of Conduct states the editors should take all reasonable steps to ensure the quality of the material they publish (COPE 2017).

Conclusions

Literary translation among all types of translations has always been distinguished by its specific lexical-semantic and grammatical-stylistic variation of the reproduction of the source text, and it may as well compete with translation of poetry. Therefore, any lexical-semantic or grammatical coincidence in the translation options may suggest the idea of some kind of loan translation, and increased frequency of such coincidences proves it. Since ancient times in the history of translation there were cases of translations of works not from the original, but from other translated versions in other languages. At the time this was justified primarily by the lack of access to the originals of those works. Today, on the one hand, the situation in this case considerably improved with an open access to the originals of the works and their translations in different languages, but on the other hand, it deteriorated with the possibility of machine translation and thanks to various translation programs (PROMT, Google Translate and others), which can encourage some translators to use these means and as a result radically distort the original work in translation.

Therefore, it deals with a double "hi-jacking" of the writer herself/himself and the authors of the original translation. From the point of view of gender aspects of ethics it is very

important to understand and accept the specificities of women's writing. As for the gender competence, we understand it as the conscious and responsible attitude of the translators towards the reproduction of the gender identity of the literary text. In translation of fiction it is necessary to pay attention to the gender factor, because ignoring it affects the quality of translation. This is why it is essential to introduce the concept of gender competence into the range of requirements for the professional competence of both translators and interpreters.

References

- BERMAN, A., 1984. *L'Épreuve de l'étranger. Culture et traduction dans l'Allemagne romantique*. Paris: Gallimard.
- CHAMBERLAIN, L., 1988. Gender and the Metaphorics of Translation. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 13 (3), 454–472.
- COPE – the Committee on Publication Ethics. Available from: <http://www.publicationethics.org> [Accessed 19 November 2017].
- DFL – Dictionnaire de Français Larousse. Available from: <http://www.larousse.fr/dictionnaires/francais> [Accessed 22 February 2017].
- GAVALDA, A., 2009. *L'échappée belle*. Paris, France: Le Dilettante.
- GODARD, B., 2001. L'Éthique du traduire: Antoine Berman et le "virage éthique" en traduction. *TTR: traduction, terminologie, rédaction*, 14 (2), 49–82.
- PYM, A., 1997. *Pour une éthique du traducteur*. Arras, Ottawa: Artois Presses Université / Presses de l'Université d'Ottawa.
- PYM, A., 2012. *On Translator Ethics. Principles for mediation between cultures*. Amsterdam, Philadelphia: John Benjamins. Available from: http://usuaris.tinet.cat/apym/publications/ethics_2012/index.html [Accessed 15 February 2017].
- SAGAN, F., 1954. *Bonjour tristesse!* Paris, France: Julliard.
- SAND, G., 2004. *Consuelo. La Comtesse de Rudolstadt*. Reprinted from ed. Calmann-Lévy 1856. Paris: Robbert Laffont.
- SPIVAK, G., 1993. The Politics of Translation. *Outside in the Teaching Machine*. London, New York: Routledge, 179–200.
- VENUTI, L., 1998. *The Scandals of Translation. Towards an Ethics of Difference*. London, New York: Routledge.
- БОРЩЕВСЬКИЙ, С., 2014. Червона картка для "Фоліо". *Київ: Літературна Україна*, 42 (5571), 12.
- ГАВАЛЬДА, А., 2010. *Глоток свободы*. Пер. И. Волевич. Москва: Астрель.
- ГАВАЛЬДА, А., 2013. *Ковток свободы*. Пер. К. Єрмолаєва. Харків: Клуб сімейного дозвілля.
- МАКСИМЕНКО, О., ФОКІН, С., 2010. Деонтологічні аспекти усного перекладу. *Проблеми семантики, прагматики та когнітивної лінгвістики*. Київ: Логос, Вип. 18, 258–266. Available from: http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/psptkl_2010_18_34 [Accessed 29 January 2017].
- САГАН, Ф., 1975. *Немного солнца в холодной воде*. Пер. Ю. Яхнина. Москва: Прогресс.
- САГАН, Ф., 1983. *Чи любите Ви Брамса? Сонячний промінь в холодній воді. Здрасстуй, печаль!* Пер. Я. Кравець. Київ: Молодь.
- САНД, Ж., 1936. *Консуэло*. Пер. А. Бекетова. Т. 1. Москва: Академия.
- САНД, Ж., 2011. *Консуэло*. Пер. В. Бойко. Харків: Фоліо.
- СУМ – *Словник української мови, 1970–1980*. Available from: <http://sum.in.ua/s/zdrastuvaty> [Accessed 22 February 2017].

Pateikta / Submitted 2017 11 23

Priimta / Accepted 2018 01 23